

Doing Theology
and
Theological Ethics
in the
Face of the Abuse Crisis

Edited *by*

Daniel J. Fleming,
James F. Keenan, SJ,
and
Hans Zollner, SJ

DOING THEOLOGY AND THEOLOGICAL ETHICS IN THE FACE OF THE ABUSE CRISIS

Theology, Ethics, and Social Justice

Copyright © 2023 Daniel J. Fleming, James F. Keenan, SJ, and Hans
Zollner, SJ.

All rights reserved.

Except for brief quotations in critical publications or reviews, no part of
this book may be reproduced in any manner without prior written
permission from the publisher. Write: Permissions, Wipf and Stock
Publishers, 199 W. 8th Ave., Suite 3, Eugene, OR 97401.

Pickwick Publications

An Imprint of Wipf and Stock Publishers

199 W. 8th Ave., Suite 3

Eugene, OR 97401

www.wipfandstock.com

SOFTCOVER ISBN: 978-1-6667-7009-4

HARDCOVER ISBN: 978-1-6667-7010-0

EBOOK ISBN: 978-1-6667-7011-7

DEDICATION

We dedicate this book to all of those whose flourishing has been undermined by any kind of abuse in the Church. We hope that it will contribute to a future in which the dignity of all who are entrusted to the ministry or care of the Church can be assured.

Global Theological Ethics—Book Series

Series Editors

Jason King, St. Vincent College

M. Therese Lysaught, Loyola University Chicago

The Global Theological Ethics book series focuses on works that feature authors from around the world, draw on resources from the traditions of Catholic theological ethics, and attend to concrete issues facing the world today. It advances the *Journal of Moral Theology*'s mission of fostering scholarship deeply rooted in traditions of inquiry about the moral life, engaged with contemporary issues, and exploring the interface of Catholic moral theology philosophy, economics, political philosophy, psychology, and more.

This series is sponsored in conjunction with the Catholic Theological Ethics in the World Church. CTEWC recognizes the need to dialogue from and beyond local cultures and to interconnect within a world church. Its global network of scholars, practitioners, and activists fosters cross-cultural, interdisciplinary conversations—via conferences, symposia, and colloquia, both in-person and virtually—about critical issues in theological ethics, shaped by shared visions of hope.

Online versions of the volumes in the *Global Theological Ethics* series are available for free download as chapters at jmt.scholasticahq.com. Paper copies may be purchased from Wipf & Stock. This dual approach reflects the *Journal of Moral Theology*'s commitment to the common good as it seeks to make the scholarship of Catholic theological ethicists broadly available, especially across borders. Additionally, you can find the series listed on the CTEWC website at catholicethics.com/book-series/catholic-theological-ethics-series/.

Series Titles

Ethical Challenges in Global Public Health: Climate Change, Pollution, and the Health of the Poor, edited by Philip J. Landrigan and Andrea Vicini, SJ (2021)

The Rising Global Cancer Pandemic: Health, Ethics, and Social Justice, edited by Andrea Vicini, SJ, Philip J. Landrigan, and Kurt Straif (2022)

Doing Theology and Theological Ethics in the Face of the Abuse Crisis, edited by Daniel J. Fleming, James F. Keenan, SJ, and Hans Zollner, SJ (2023)

A Prophet to the Peoples: Paul Farmer's Witness and Theological Ethics, edited by Jennie Weiss Block, M. Therese Lysaught, and Alexandre A. Martins (2023)

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	ix
Introduction	
<i>Daniel J. Fleming, James F. Keenan, SJ, and Hans Zollner, SJ</i>	1
1. Sexual Abuse in the Church and the Violation of Vulnerable Agency <i>Michelle Becka</i>	11
2. Vulnerability, Ecclesial Abuse, and “Vulnerable Adults” <i>Carolina Montero Orphanopoulos</i>	26
3. John Navone, SJ’s Theology of Failure and Its Importance for Pope Francis’s Spirituality in Light of the Church’s Pastoral Mission to Victim/Survivors of Abuse <i>Dawn Eden Goldstein</i>	40
4. Sexual Scandals in the Catholic Church: The Urgency of Building a New Formative Culture <i>Ronaldo Zacharias</i>	58
5. Design Thinking in the Catholic Church’s Organizational Structures: Responding to the Wicked Problem of the Sex Abuse Crisis <i>Stephanie Ann Puen</i>	72
6. Child Protection in the Church as a Family of God <i>Idara Otu</i>	87
7. Power versus Ministry? Recent Challenges for Priestly Formation in Responding to the Double Crisis in the Catholic Church <i>Štefan Novotný</i>	106
8. Clergy Sexual Abuse as Moral Injury: Confronting a Wounded and Wounding Church <i>Marcus Mescher</i>	122

9. Obeying God's Plan? The Spiritual Abuse of Nuns <i>Rocío Figueroa and David Tombs</i>	140
10. Sexually Violated: A Moral Theological Response to Child's Rights <i>Anthonia Bolanle Ojo</i>	158
11. "Journeying Together:" Does a Synodal Church Improve Respect for the Human Person? <i>Daniel Bogner</i>	176
12. Theological (De)Formation? The Sex Abuse Crisis in the Context of Nuptial Ecclesiology and the Theology of Priesthood <i>Tina Beattie</i>	195
13. Between the Pillory Treatment and Reliable Clarification: On the Role of the Media in Response to the Sexual Abuse Crisis in the Catholic Church in Poland <i>Konrad Glombik</i>	213
14. A Clergy Abuse Truth and Reconciliation Commission <i>Kate Jackson-Meyer</i>	230
15. Abuse, Cover-Up, and the Need for a Reform of Church and Theology <i>Werner G. Jeanrond</i>	247
16. The Need for the Historiographical Approach to Understand and Address the Sex Abuse Crisis in the Catholic Church <i>Massimo Faggioli</i>	265
17. Ecclesiology and the Challenge of Ecclesiological Failure <i>Richard Lennan</i>	281
18. Interconnectedness: The Thread that Enables a Theological and Synodal Response to Abuse <i>Gill Goulding</i>	296

19. Can Purgatory Help? Reflections from Dramatic Theology in the Context of the Abuse Crisis	
<i>Nikolaus Wandering</i>	312
20. Mission, Reform and Suffering: The Challenge of the Sexual Abuse Crisis in the Church	
<i>Neil Ormerod</i>	329
21. Sexual Abuse in an Ecclesial Context and Gender Perspective: Challenges for the Ethical Administration of Power	
<i>Claudia Leal</i>	345
22. Clergy Sexual Abuse, Trauma-Informed Theology, and the Promotion of Resilience	
<i>Nuala Kenny</i>	360

Acknowledgments

We want to thank the contributors to this volume. This international contribution required a great deal of shared confidence and respect in responding critically and theologically to the sexual abuse crisis in the church. The quality of these essays conveys, we think, the breadth and depth of that collaborative social trust.

We thank the participants in the virtual table which was central to this book's development. The meetings were so engaging that we have decided to continue with the initiative. See <https://catholicethics.com/virtual-tables/> for further information.

This volume has benefitted greatly from the support of a number of students at Boston College. Jessica Saeli supported our authors for whom English is not their primary language by editing their essays for style, syntax, and expression. Samuel Peterson and Steven Roche ensured that the technical elements of essays—especially their footnotes—were consistent with the *Journal of Moral Theology's* style guide. We also express our gratitude to Alexander Rivera for his assistance in translating Claudia Leal's contribution (in chapter twenty-one) from Spanish to English.

Finally, we thank the editors of the *Journal of Moral Theology* for their superb guidance and support.

Daniel J. Fleming, James F. Keenan, SJ, and Hans Zollner, SJ